

**Notes of the meeting of the
CORNWALL AND WEST DEVON MINING LANDSCAPE WHS BID
PARTNERSHIP**

Held on Friday 28th May 2004 10.00 – 13.00, New County Hall, Truro

Present: Cllr. Helen Richards (Portfolio Holder - Environment and Heritage, CCC & Partnership Chairperson)
Nicholas Johnson (Historic Environment Manager, Historic Environment Service, CCC)
WHS Bid Team (Deborah Boden, Simon Thorpe, Barry Gamble, Bryn Tapper, Ainsley Cocks)
Mike Hawkey - CCC
Monica Kelly - CCC
Lesley Garlick – Devon County Council
David Andrew – Devon County Council
Gillian Hall – Baseresult Holdings Ltd. (for Allan Reynolds)
Cllr. Colin Brewer – North Cornwall District Council
Dr Sharron P Schwartz – University of Exeter
John Bolitho – Gorseth Kernow
Vernon Baldry – The Trevithick Society
Frances Griffith – Devon County Council
Stephen Gill – West Devon Borough Council
Cllr. Robin Pike – West Devon Borough Council
John Goodridge - Morwellham and Tamar Valley Trust
Joff Bullen – Cornish Mining Development Association
Cllr. Mike Clayton – Kerrier District Council
Colin Murley – Cornish Heritage
W C H Rowe – The Cornish Stannary Parliament
Nicholas Molyneux - English Heritage
David Hooley – English Heritage
Kevin Williams – Baseresult Holdings Ltd.
Martin Eddy – Caradon District Council
Cllr. Kath Pascoe – Caradon District Council
Andy Wetherelt – Camborne School of Mines
John Fleet – CERES
Tim Selman – Tamar Valley AONB
Barry Kinsmen – Federation of Old Cornwall Societies
Tim Brooks - CLA
Peter Jennings – The Trevithick Trust
Keith Menadue – Cornish Institute of Engineers and Industrial Trust
Sara Chambers – Royal Cornwall Museum
Steve Edwards – Penwith District Council

Steve Crummay – CCC
Malcolm Pinch – Restormel Borough Council
Cllr. Greta Madigan – Devon County Council
Alyson Cooper – Carrick District Council
Tony Rule – Carn Brea Mining Society
Stephen Polglase – Carn Brea Mining Society
Peter Ealey – Cornwall RIGS Group

Apologies

Tony Sandercock – Kerrier District Council
Roger Halliday – Duchy of Cornwall
Vic Harman – Calstock Parish Archive Trust
Ann Pattison – CCC
Phil Hosken – The Trevithick Society
Carol Wilson – SWERDA
Howard Roberts – CCC
Brian Shipman – CCC
Bill Lakin – Pendeen Community Heritage/St Just Mines Research Group
Georgina McLaren – Cornwall Enterprise Company
Jeremy Clitherow – English Nature
Andrew McDouall – English Nature
Colin Buck – CCC
Paul Walton – Cornwall AONB, CCC
Peter Roberts – Plymouth Mineral Mining Club
Cllr. Fred Greenslade – Carrick District Council
Paul Richards - Cornwall Industrial Archaeology Advisory Group
Paul Brough – CCC
Dr Tom Greeves
Stephen Bohane – SWERDA
Bob Le Marchant – Morwellham and Tamar Valley Trust
Dr Keith Russ – Cornish Mining Development Association
Debbie Smith – Cornwall Enterprise Company
Cllr. Neil Plummer - CCC/Kerrier District Council
Cllr. Anne Boosey – Restormel Borough Council
Lawrie Prideaux – CERES
David Moore – Caradon District Council
Karl Roberts – Carrick District Council
Devon Archaeological Society

Agenda Item

1 **Welcome by Councillor Helen Richards** (Partnership Chairperson)

Councillor Richards welcomed attendees to the meeting, introduced the Bid team and outlined the focus and format of the meeting.

2 **Apologies** (see above)

3 **Notes of the previous meeting (02.04.04) and matters arising**

Nicholas Johnson (Historic Environment Manager, CCC)

- **The Cornish language title** for the Nomination Document has been included on the back cover and on the frontispiece after consultation with Jenefer Lowe, the Cornwall County Council Arts Officer. A draft document entitled 'Strategy for the Cornish Language' has also recently been published by Cornwall County Council to address the issue of which of the three main forms of Cornish should be used by local authorities and in education. (See: <http://www.cornwall.gov.uk/cornish/strategy/default.htm>)
- **The attendance list** for the last Partnership meeting was inadvertently removed and the list of attendees for that meeting is therefore incomplete
- **South Crofty** A meeting between members of the WHS Bid team, Kerrier District Council and the WHS Officer Working Group took place subsequent to the last meeting of the Partnership to discuss the situation of South Crofty in relation to the Camborne and Redruth Mining District boundary. The decision taken was to leave the draft boundary unaltered and therefore South Crofty remains outside that Bid area. The World Heritage Site Office will be looking at the protection of the head frame at South Crofty, however, in conjunction with English Heritage and Baseresult Holdings Ltd. The Office will also be working with Kerrier District Council to protect the future of other key buildings on the site such as Bartle's Foundry

Kevin Williams: Any protection of the head frame will have to be flexible enough to allow for the modification required to make it suitable for use in the future.

Nicholas Johnson: One of the main concerns that the Bid team have in relation to the head frame is that the mines' inclusion with the World Heritage Site would effectively prevent its modification. Protection by Listing would be flexible enough to allow for the alterations required.

Kevin Williams: Any change to the head frame would also depend on a suitable source of funding being found beyond that which is available to Baseresult Holdings Ltd.

- **The WHS Bid Economic Impact Assessment (EIA)** The validity of the statistics used within the economic impact assessment has been questioned by a member of the Partnership. Atlantic Consultants have been approached regarding the statistics and also the concerns voiced at the last meeting relating to the social impact on communities of the increased visitor numbers expected after inscription. The EIA will be released to the wider audience with a covering note addressing the limitations of the data available at the time of the report production. The baseline statistics also need to be reviewed as new

information becomes available when the marketing strategy is implemented. The World Heritage Site Co-ordinator has agreed to consider further impact studies as part of the evaluation of the marketing, education and outreach strategies

- **The WHS Bid Marketing Strategy** The aims and principles of the management plan, including the amendments noted at the last meeting, have now formed the relevant sections of the Draft Nomination Document. The aims and principles will also now be incorporated into the Draft Management Plan which will be presented to the Partnership at the next meeting
- **The Cornish Flag** Councillor Neil Plummer has requested that greater prominence be given to the Cornish flag within the Draft Nomination Document. Discussion resulted in the conclusion that an image of the flag be used in section three of the Document, with a caption that indicates the origins of its design and the relationship with St Piran and tin.

The minutes of the previous meeting were endorsed by the Partnership

4 Project Progress Report

Deborah Boden (World Heritage Site Co-ordinator, CCC)

The Management Plan

- The WHS Bid task timetable has been amended to allow an extra month for the Officer Working Group to develop the section of the plan that addresses the key management issues. The Partnership meeting scheduled for 8th October will be moved back a month to accommodate this and a new date of 11th November is suggested.

The project progress report was endorsed by the Partnership

5 Nomination Document (Draft)

Barry Gamble (Consultant) gave a PowerPoint presentation outlining the stages that led to the production of the Draft Nomination Document.

- September 2003 - meeting with ICOMOS (advisers to UNESCO) to discuss the direction and focus of the Nomination Document
- Document template designed
- Reorganisation of the research material gathered since the commencement of the Bid process in 2001
- Draft text produced with parallel editing by the WHS Bid Officer Working Group on behalf of the Partnership
- Images collated and new photographs taken
- Illustrated draft created
- Editorial panel instigated from within the Officer Working Group to oversee the production of the Document
- Draft Nomination Document presented to the Partnership for endorsement and release for public consultation

Nicholas Molyneux (Chairman - Officer Working Group): A considerable effort has gone into the production of the Draft Nomination Document and it is now a masterly summary of a vast amount of data. It is acknowledged that there are errors and omissions, and a number of the illustrations could be improved but it is considered that it is now ready for public consultation. It should be borne in mind that the structure of the Document has been set by UNESCO and any comments should therefore be addressing the *content* and not the *structure*. Mr Molyneux recommended that the Partnership endorse the Draft Nomination Document for public consultation.

The Draft Nomination Document was accepted by the Partnership for public consultation

Colin Murley commented that the Document is lacking in Cornish character and no mention is made of Cornwall being a territorial possession of the Duchy of Cornwall. He noted that reference is made to a number of experts which have had an input into the content of the text. A meeting should be arranged for the experts and also a representative of the Duchy to meet the Partnership to discuss the issue of cultural identity in detail. The Document as it stands is in danger of totally ignoring the Cornish dimension. **Nicholas Johnson** commented that the WHS Bid is focused mainly on sites but we would welcome any comments on the cultural aspect of the Bid during the consultation phase of the process. Regarding the experts consulted, Barry Gamble and the team have consulted many specialists and a significant number of them are members of the Partnership or specialist panels.

The Document celebrates the wonderful achievements of the miners of Cornwall and West Devon, and the objective of the Bid team and this Partnership is to celebrate this vital aspect of Cornish culture on the international stage.

In relation to the early phase of mining, some of the information provided by Mr Murley of Cornish Heritage relating to the Stannary Parliament has been incorporated into the Document and Allen Buckley, Professor Burt, and Professor Payton have been consulted in order to arrive at a balanced view. Comments made during the consultation period will be appraised and any appropriate changes made before the next Partnership meeting at the end of July. **Councillor Helen Richards** noted that the Nomination Document is a draft only and that the Bid team will be considering all comments made during the consultation period.

Colin Murley asked how we are going to give the thumbs down on the experts. He believed that representatives from English Heritage are programmed to promote England and the absence of the word 'Celtic' in the Draft betrays their presence and their influence. Also, half of the Duchy of Cornwall's income was from minerals according to Crispin Gill which is ignored within the Document. These facts should be included within the Nomination Document based on authenticity, which is an important UNESCO criterion.

The preamble to the NARA Document on Authenticity (1994) indicates that '...the search for cultural identity is sometimes pursued through aggressive nationalism and the suppression of the cultures of minorities, the essential contribution made by the consideration of authenticity in conservation practice is to clarify and illuminate the collective memory of humanity.'

It is understandable that the English majority within Cornwall naturally think in terms of promoting England; the Nomination Document should be presented as *naturally* promoting Cornwall.

Nick Molyneux: As the representative of English Heritage here today, there has been no deliberate attempt to exclude the word 'Celtic' from the Nomination Document and the term did not crop up during its preparation. There will be ample time for everyone to make their comments during the consultation period and you have already submitted some in writing today.

The earlier comment relating to the consumption of Cornish pasties is an interesting one and there is an image depicting miners eating pasties on page 45 of the Document.

Colin Murley: To ensure that there is no public confusion could a label be placed on the cover stating that this is not the final document? **Councillor Helen Richards** noted that the word DRAFT was on every page and that this served the purpose well.

A member noted: The use of dialect words within the Document has to be done with some care. As an example, the term 'crowst' is a west Cornwall term, whereas 'crib' is used in east Cornwall. **Barry Gamble** commented that the term 'crowst' was used in a caption to specifically support a photograph by J. C. Burrows of East Pool Mine in west Cornwall. The issue of dialect is important and terms such as this may be appropriate for research in the future by the World Heritage Site Office. **Robin Pike** noted that there are differences of pronunciation in west Devon also, such as Morwell-ham and Mor-*well*-ham. It is important to understand, however, that it is a draft document and that the fine details can be sorted out during the consultation.

David Andrew: Congratulations should go to the Bid team on the production of the Draft Nomination Document. The issue of monitoring, however, while a focus chiefly of the Management Plan, needs to be fully addressed as it is a major concern of UNESCO.

John Bolitho: The Marketing Strategy needs to address the communities that came about overseas as the result of Cornish migration. The Cornish Association of Victoria is probably the largest in the world and its members regard the heritage in Cornwall to be *their* heritage also. Extensive research into local communities has been undertaken by the organisations in Victoria and the Copper Triangle area which should be borne in mind. **Deborah Boden** replied that space limitations within the Nomination Document prevented the issue being covered in great detail, but the transposition of Cornish culture overseas is very important and the overseas descendants of migrant miners have been identified as one of the key targets for the marketing strategy over the next five years. The Cornwall Tourist Board and the Devon and Cornwall Overseas Marketing organisation have been in discussion with the Bid team with a view towards putting together a marketing campaign to address this market. The Bid team would be grateful for any contact details in relation to those Australian organisations.

Colin Murley: It is important that the sources used in the writing of the Nomination Document are given in full and that the experts consulted are identified. **Nicholas Johnson** assured Partners that the sources are given in the extensive bibliography at the rear of the Document in the standard way and the experts consulted are in many cases members of the Partnership. Consultees will be acknowledged in the usual way.

Colin Murley noted that he thought that the role of Celts within British history is overlooked in the National Curriculum for schools which indicates the institutionalised bias which is deep within the system. *Authenticity* is vitally important to the Cornish, and to the Bid.

6 Management Plan – Progress report

Simon Thorpe (WHS Planning Advice Officer, CCC)

Time constraints have meant that the timetable for the delivery of the Management Plan has had to be altered by one month.

The Management Plan comprises six sections, all of which have been completed apart from sections four and six. All the sections will be completed by the time of the Officer Working Group meeting that is taking place on 16th June. The OWG will meet twice in total before the next Partnership meeting [26th July] to fine tune the Document before its presentation to the Partnership members.

The Progress Report on the Management Plan was endorsed by the Partnership

7 Any Other Business

Councillor Helen Richards: The South Caradon mine [page 112 of the Nomination Document] is due to be featured on the BBC Restoration programme during the summer.

Martin Eddy: The programme is due to be aired during the last week in July and the format pits three buildings against each other, with one coming out the eventual winner. The South Caradon piece has already been filmed and he hoped that everyone should support the mine by phoning in their votes when the programme is transmitted in July.

8 Date of next meeting: Monday 26th July 2004

End of meeting